

pfSense Packages - Bug #11290

FRR Service not following CARP Status IP

01/22/2021 02:18 PM - Christian McDonald

Status:	Closed	Start date:	01/22/2021
Priority:	Normal	Due date:	
Assignee:	Jim Pingle	% Done:	0%
Category:	FRR	Estimated time:	0.00 hour
Target version:		Affected Architecture:	
Affected Version:	2.5.x		
Description			
FRR 1.0.0 is not properly starting/stopping in regards to the configured CARP status IP.			

History

#1 - 01/23/2021 06:52 PM - Christian McDonald

Update: I'm not seeing this in the latest snapshots now. So I'm not entirely sure what's going on. There might be an edge case when upgrading from 2.4.x branch and porting the configuration over, not sure. But this might be closeable unless someone else can replicate this.

#2 - 01/23/2021 09:15 PM - Alhusein Zawi

please provide the Steps to reproduce the issue.

#3 - 01/24/2021 02:04 PM - Christian McDonald

I experienced this with a very simple OSPF configuration that I had on the 2.4 stable branch. This was an in-place upgrade to the 2.5 development branch (eager to begin testing WireGuard). Initially I was seeing FRR 1) not starting on system boot-up and 2) not following CARP VIP status. So, I uninstalled FRR 1.0.0, neutered my config.xml file by hand (removing any and all references to FRR configuration), reinstalled FRR 1.0.0 and reconfigured the packaged from scratch. I thought I was still observing the issue, but it seems to be working correctly now...so I'm not entirely sure what happened.

Either way, it would be worth at least keeping an eye out for this potential edge case.

#4 - 01/25/2021 08:05 AM - Jim Pingle

- Status changed from New to Closed

- Target version deleted (2.5.0)

I'll close this out for now, but if someone can reproduce it, we can open it back up with more details about exactly what it takes to replicate.

#5 - 04/20/2021 08:41 AM - Jeremy Utley

I am encountering this exact issue on 2.5.1 now. I have a pair of 2.5.1 PFSense CE installs with IPSec connections to the AWS Site-To-Site VPN service. FRR is installed and speaks BGP to AWS over the IPSec connections. The background is the machines were initially installed with 2.4.5p1, upgraded to 2.5, then upgraded to 2.5.1. FRR was installed after the upgrade to 2.5.1, BGP peering was established on both machines with AWS successfully, and then the "CARP Status IP" option was set to the LAN CARP IP. With this setting, putting the primary into maintenance mode moves the CARP IP, but FRR does not start up on the standby server - it remains running on the primary. Also, upon reboot of the primary, FRR does not automatically start when the CARP IP goes to MASTER state like it should.

Not sure where to look for additional information to troubleshoot - the system logs indicate nothing whatsoever that I can see. But if someone can give me some tips on what to look for to help diagnose this issue, I'll be happy to help as much as I can.

#6 - 04/21/2021 02:59 AM - Viktor Gurov

Jeremy Utley wrote:

I am encountering this exact issue on 2.5.1 now. I have a pair of 2.5.1 PFSense CE installs with IPSec connections to the AWS Site-To-Site VPN service. FRR is installed and speaks BGP to AWS over the IPSec connections. The background is the machines were initially installed with 2.4.5p1, upgraded to 2.5, then upgraded to 2.5.1. FRR was installed after the upgrade to 2.5.1, BGP peering was established on both machines with AWS successfully, and then the "CARP Status IP" option was set to the LAN CARP IP. With this setting, putting the primary into maintenance mode moves the CARP IP, but FRR does not start up on the standby server - it remains running on the primary. Also, upon reboot of the primary, FRR does not automatically start when the CARP IP goes to MASTER state like it should.

Unable to reproduce - all FRR services started/stopped as expected when I put the master node to 'CARP Maintenance Mode' or 'Temporary Disable CARP'.

Please provide more information about your FRR configuration - are you using BGP TCP MD5 authentication? AgentX(SNMP)/RPKI options? Something special?

#7 - 05/03/2021 01:03 PM - Jeremy Utley

Viktor Gurov wrote:

Jeremy Utley wrote:

I am encountering this exact issue on 2.5.1 now. I have a pair of 2.5.1 PFSense CE installs with IPSec connections to the AWS Site-To-Site VPN service. FRR is installed and speaks BGP to AWS over the IPSec connections. The background is the machines were initially installed with 2.4.5p1, upgraded to 2.5, then upgraded to 2.5.1. FRR was installed after the upgrade to 2.5.1, BGP peering was established on both machines with AWS successfully, and then the "CARP Status IP" option was set to the LAN CARP IP. With this setting, putting the primary into maintenance mode moves the CARP IP, but FRR does not start up on the standby server - it remains running on the primary. Also, upon reboot of the primary, FRR does not automatically start when the CARP IP goes to MASTER state like it should.

Unable to reproduce - all FRR services started/stopped as expected when I put the master node to 'CARP Maintenance Mode' or 'Temporary Disable CARP'.

Please provide more information about your FRR configuration - are you using BGP TCP MD5 authentication? AgentX(SNMP)/RPKI options? Something special?

Nothing special at all. Pretty much about as basic as can be while still providing BGP peering - private AS numbers, publishing a single /24 subnet to AWS, and accepting a single /16 subnet from AWS. Over the last few days, both our firewalls were rebooted. CARP IP is back up on primary, but FRR has never started.

It's obvious something is going on, as there are other reports of similar problems in the Forums (See: <https://forum.netgate.com/topic/162722/frr-doesn-t-follow-carp-after-2-5-0-upgrade>). And it doesn't seem to always happen, either - but for some it does. What log files should I (or someone else) be looking at to try to diagnose this problem? Status -> System Logs -> Routing for my machine is completely empty since Apr 19, while the machine itself rebooted on April 30 - which means FRR **should** have started on that day (when the CARP IP went to Master state after that reboot).