pfSense - Bug #3191

Quality RRD inaccuracies and failure to update status in some circumstances

09/09/2013 04:48 PM - Chris Buechler

Status:	Resolved		**Start date:**	09/09/2013
Priority:	Normal		**Due date:**	
Assignee:	Chris Buechler		**% Done:**	0%
Category:	Gateway Monitoring		**Estimated time:**	0.00 hour
Target version:	2.3			
Plus Target Version:			**Affected Version:**	All
Release Notes:			**Affected Architecture:**	

Description

There are some circumstances in which apinger puts in incorrect quality RRD data and fails to notice downtime. This needs some more specifics, but here are known examples of circumstances that fail.

1) use a monitor IP with 80% packet loss, with "Down" at the default 10, and it won't detect any packet loss and graphs no packet loss.
2) use a monitor IP with 80% packet loss, with "Down" at 30, and it'll take the gateway down appropriately but the RRD data will be wrong. Shows 100% loss much of the time.

There may be other specific circumstances that need to be added here.

This is true across all versions that have ever used apinger.

History

#1 - 02/18/2014 03:44 AM - Ermal Luçi

- Target version changed from 2.1.1 to 2.2

I am not sure this is something to be fixed for 2.1.1 so putting to 2.2.

#2 - 07/22/2014 06:03 AM - Jim Thompson

- Assignee set to Chris Buechler

need more info on 'when' this happens (why would be great)

#3 - 07/23/2014 05:42 PM - Chris Buechler

- Assignee changed from Chris Buechler to Ermal Luçi

There are a few descriptions of problems in tickets in Kayako under the apinger-badstats tag.

#4 - 09/12/2014 03:34 PM - Ermal Luçi

- Status changed from New to Feedback

Patched apinger, need some feedback if the issue is solved now.

#5 - 09/19/2014 03:02 PM - Ermal Luçi

For the record, properly recover from disconnected sockets patch put in.

#6 - 10/13/2014 03:39 PM - Chris Buechler

- Status changed from Feedback to New

The first issue as noted originally is still a problem as described. Throw a limiter on an upstream system that drops 80% of the monitor pings, and the packet loss and latency reported by apinger are completely wrong. Reports somewhere around 3 ms with 0% loss when in reality, reading back a pcap with tshark:

```
ICMP Service Response Time (SRT) Statistics (all times in ms):
Filter: ip.addr==192.0.2.202

Requests   Replies   Lost      % Loss
38         9         29         76.3%

Minimum   Maximum   Mean      Median    SDeviation   Min Frame Max Frame
90.927    94.974    92.275    92.089    1.379        54        34
```

Its pings are getting replies in ~92-94 ms (not the 3 it's showing), and the loss doesn't show up at all.

Change "Down" to 30, and the RRD data is correct for loss, but not latency.

#8 - 11/11/2014 02:51 PM - Chris Buechler

- Assignee changed from Ermal Luçi to Chris Buechler

to me to re-test

#9 - 11/26/2014 01:34 AM - Chris Buechler

- Status changed from New to Feedback

- Target version changed from 2.2 to 2.3

things are much better with apinger in general after fixes in the past 1-2 months. I can still replicate some issues here, but it's unlikely they're ones that would occur in the real world. Given things are better than in current stable releases as is, and touching apinger is fraught with peril, I'm setting this out to 2.3 for feedback and further review.

#10 - 11/17/2015 09:24 PM - Michael Kellogg

things are still an issue on troublesome connections

#11 - 11/20/2015 01:26 AM - Chris Buechler

- Category changed from Gateways to Gateway Monitoring

- Status changed from Feedback to Confirmed

#12 - 12/15/2015 05:55 PM - Chris Buechler

- Status changed from Confirmed to Resolved

this was resolved by replacing apinger

```
ICMP Service Response Time (SRT) Statistics (all times in ms):
Filter: ip.addr==192.0.2.202

Requests   Replies   Lost      % Loss
38         9         29         76.3%

Minimum   Maximum   Mean      Median    SDeviation   Min Frame Max Frame
90.927    94.974    92.275    92.089    1.379        54        34
```